



# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Bungalow 604, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115

[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) email: [smiragli@ccsf.edu](mailto:smiragli@ccsf.edu)

### CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council FINAL MINUTES

Wednesday, March 6, 2024, 2:30-5:00 pm  
MUB 140 or Via Zoom

[March 6, 2024 Meeting Materials](#) | [ASEC Zoom Meeting Pro Tips](#) | [Community Guidelines](#) | [Guide to CCSF Acronyms](#)

**Council members present:** Adam D'Acquisto, Monica Bosson, Jessica Buchsbaum, Matthew Duckworth, Katia Fuchs, Michael Greenberg, J. Malcolm Hillan, Thomas Kennedy, Jennifer Kienzle, Fanny Law, Alex Leyton, Alexis Litzky, Ying Liu, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ron Page, Craig Persiko, Caroline Priestley, Robin Pugh, Louis Schubert, Fred Teti

**Council members absent:** Nuala Sheetz (on leave), Richard Taha

**Other Senators present:** Abigail Bornstein, Neela Chatterjee, Rachel Cohen, Carla Crocomo, Malaika Finkelstein, Diana Garcia Denson, Landi Ehlne, Kate Frei, Simon Hanson, Claire Heimer, Andrew King, Lisa King, Craig Kleinman, Christa Lewis, Edward Murray, Wynn Newberry, Mitra Sapienza, Leslie Simon, Megan Sweeney, Holly Stevens

**Guests:** Cynthia Dewar, Jennifer Kienzle

#### 1. Call to Order 2:37

President Miraglia read the land acknowledgement:

*We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders, and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.*

Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at

- <https://native-land.ca>
- <https://www.ramaytush.org/>
- <https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/>

#### 2. Public Comment

- a. Fred Teti: Provided an update from the Ed Policies committee.
- b. Madeline Mueller: Comment about the PAEC and Frida Kahlo Quick Build project.
- c. Tom Kennedy: Comment about the ASCIP sexual harassment training and if there has been clarification about faculty who have already taken this training.

### 3. Reports

- a. Chancellor's Report  
The Chancellor provided a brief video report for the Council. The report included updates about the return of the Diego Rivera Mural, printing of the fall schedule, DegreeWorks, pausing the Frida Kahlo Quick-Build project, and California Senate Bill 895.
- b. Officers Report  
President Miraglia provided a report. See Appendix A for the full report.
- c. AFT Report  
AFT Secretary Robin Pugh provided an update about the current status of AFT elections and invited everyone to attend upcoming assembly meetings.
- d. Student Chancellor report - no report at this meeting.
- e. Committee on Committees report  
Vice President Law presented a list of appointments on behalf of the Committee on Committees.

### 4. Consent Agenda

- a. Approval of Minutes from February 21, 2024

**Resolution 2024.03.06.4A** Approval of Minutes: Minutes from February 21, 2024

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the minutes for February 21, 2024.

Adopted by consent.

- b. Approval of Committee Appointments

**Resolution 2024.03.06.4B** Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the following appointments:

**Noncredit Adult Education**

Chad Stephenson (Library), reappointment  
Fanny Law (ESL) reappointment

**Honors Issues**

Becky Ancheta (Behavioral Sciences), reappointment  
Joe Reyes (Biology), reappointment

**Education Policies**

Steven Mayers (English), reappointment  
Eliza Woo (Biology), reappointment

**Equivalency**

Susmita Sengupta (Biology), reappointment

**Faculty Professional Development Activities**

Fred Teti (OLET & Math), reappointment

**Student Equity Strategies**

Alex Leyton (English), reappointment

**College Professional Development Committee**

Alex Leyton (English), new appointment

Adopted by consent.

c. Approval of Updated OER Coordinator Description

**Resolution 2024.03.06.4C** Approval of Updated OER Coordinator Description

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the updated OER Coordinator Description.

Adopted by consent.

d. Approval of Equity PD Coordinator Description

**Resolution 2024.03.06.4D** Approval of Equity PD Coordinator Description

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the updated Equity PD Coordinator Description.

Adopted by consensus.

e. Approval of Updated Faculty Coordination Appointment Process

**Resolution 2024.03.06.4E** Approval of Updated Faculty Coordination Appointment Process

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the Updated Faculty Coordination Appointment Process.

Adopted by consensus.

f. Approval of AP 6.32 Fall 2023 Revision

**Resolution 2024.03.06.4F** Approval of AP 6.32 Fall 2023 Revision

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the AP 6.32 Fall 2023 Revision.

Adopted by consensus.

g. Approval of AP 6.34 Fall 2023 Revision

**Resolution 2024.03.06.4G** Approval of AP 6.34 Fall 2023 Revision

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the AP 6.34 Fall 2023 Revision.

Adopted by consensus.

5. Unfinished Business

a. [Resolution of Censure of the Board of Trustees for Failure to Meet Accreditation Standards](#)

Mitra Sapienza, immediate past AS President, re-introduced the item with changes from the last meeting. Councilmember Robin Pugh introduced a modified resolution from the floor and Councilmember Mueller shared some additional materials. There was a robust discussion with comments about the censure resolution and additional possible changes or updates. Appendix B is the chat history for this item. President Miralgia agreed to bring the item back to the next meeting.

6. The council took a 5-minute break.

7. New Business

a. [Noncredit in CVC State-Wide Resolution](#)

Susan Schall, ESL faculty and DE Noncredit Coordinator, and Councilmember Fred Teti led a brief presentation about the purpose and context of the CVC-OEI. An ASCCC resolution was brought forward for endorsement by the Council.

**Resolution 2024.03.06.7A Noncredit in CVC State-Wide Resolution**

Resolved, the Executive Council endorses the proposed Noncredit in CVC resolution and requests that the Academic Senate President submit the resolution for review at the Spring 2024 Area B meeting.

*Whereas, the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) has charged the California Virtual Campus (CVC) with ensuring that significantly more students are able to complete their educational goals by increasing both access to and success in high-quality online courses; and*

*Whereas, the CVC lists in its Exchange noncredit courses only under somewhat restrictive circumstances and does not provide an adequate subject-based filter to select noncredit courses from its offerings; and*

*Whereas the CCCCCO emphasizes not only degree and certificate completion for all students, including career development and college preparation (CDCP) certificates in noncredit, but also providing access to students of diverse backgrounds; therefore be it*

*Resolved that the Academic Senate for California Community College (ASCCC) work with the CCCCCO and other appropriate higher ed partners with the goal of having the CVC include noncredit courses from both Home and Teaching colleges, regardless of how the noncredit courses are coded, and with an adequate subject-based filter so students can more easily search for noncredit offerings, especially ones whose subject is ESL.*

Adopted by consensus.

b. Constitution and Bylaws

Councilmember Alexis Litzky presented results from the January 2024 AS Plenary roundtable poll and some data about the make-up of the Academic Senate membership. There was a brief introduction about possible updates to the AS Constitution. The council asked for additional information and to return to the discussion at the next meeting.

8. Adjournment at 5:00pm



## AS President's Report - March 6, 2024

- [ASCCC Spring Plenary](#) - San Jose Marriott, April 18-20
- (ASCCC) [2024 Noncredit Institute](#) will be held **May 2 through 3, 2024**
- ACCJC [Partners in Excellence](#) (annual conference), May 9-10
- Meetings next year - Brown Act allows for ASEC meetings to occur in two public locations in SF simultaneously
- Spring 2024 ASEC Work
  - Generative AI - Set of Recommendations, Equity, Pedagogy, Policy
    - [Sonoma State Website](#)
    - TLTR Conversations (3/11), ASEC Webpage in development.
  - EFF (back on ASEC agenda on 3/20)
  - Committee Structure (back on ASEC agenda on 3/20)
  - AS Constitution/Bylaws (on today's agenda)

## APPENDIX B

15:14:05 From Mitra Sapienza, she/her, ASCCC North Rep to Everyone:

is there a digital copy for folks online to see?

15:14:14 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Anything on line?

15:14:20 From EC Kimberly Keenan to Everyone:

Yes - we need to see it too

15:15:21 From EC Alexis Litzky, she/her to Everyone:

Here is the link Robin shared (it's ugly but should work):

[https://nam04.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/ap/w-59584e83/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fcitycollegesf-my.sharepoint.com%2F%3A%2Fpersonal%2Frpugh\\_ccsf\\_edu%2FEUsjuMp7ydVctkPq7-eYMUKB5vQAlnaoH5nNCkeDfIBGbQ&data=05%7C02%7Calitzky%40ccsf.edu%7Cd70a023ef72749033b2008dc3e1d0064%7C5e0f22d68a16417ebf3ad081c98b38d8%7C0%7C0%7C638453541500474315%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ikk1haWwiLCJXVCi6Mn0%3D%7C0%7C%7C%7C&sdata=aFT8vmiYoidI106g5NNV7VcksxAkzCDgEkLyvYPyQ78%3D&reserved=0](https://nam04.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/ap/w-59584e83/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fcitycollegesf-my.sharepoint.com%2F%3A%2Fpersonal%2Frpugh_ccsf_edu%2FEUsjuMp7ydVctkPq7-eYMUKB5vQAlnaoH5nNCkeDfIBGbQ&data=05%7C02%7Calitzky%40ccsf.edu%7Cd70a023ef72749033b2008dc3e1d0064%7C5e0f22d68a16417ebf3ad081c98b38d8%7C0%7C0%7C638453541500474315%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ikk1haWwiLCJXVCi6Mn0%3D%7C0%7C%7C%7C&sdata=aFT8vmiYoidI106g5NNV7VcksxAkzCDgEkLyvYPyQ78%3D&reserved=0)

15:19:52 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

not opening

15:20:13 From EC Alexis Litzky, she/her to Everyone:

Replying to "not opening"

I see others in there, but you're not able to open the doc?

15:33:06 From EC Tom Kennedy (he, him, his) to Everyone:

Replying to "not opening"

I'm able to open it.

15:34:08 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Correct Lou. This is fear-mongering. The ACCJC does not want to see us hugging and singing Kumbya . . . They want to see a functional Board, with solid leadership. Our campus community and the faculty has been recognized as getting it done. This message of this resolution is to the Board.

15:34:23 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

Reacted to "Correct Lou. This is..." with 👍

15:37:01 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

Reacted to "Correct Lou. This is..." with 👍

15:38:34 From EC Alexis Litzky, she/her to Everyone:

Anyone interested in learning more about AB1725:

<https://www.asccc.org/content/history-asccc-project-partial-history-passage-ab-1725>

15:42:28 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

Craig 100

15:42:55 From Melinda Weil to Everyone:

Thank you, Craig!

15:43:05 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Yes Edward! Would like to note: Certain Board members who were (unsurprisingly) splitting their efforts between the college and furthering their political careers have just been relieved by voters, at least temporarily, of the latter. Are voters realizing they may have made a mistake placing them in a responsible position last election? If so, that would align with my observations of their team's performance as Trustees. Would urge a vote by EC members to support Censure.

15:44:16 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

Reacted to "Yes Edward! Would li..." with 👍

15:48:05 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

We're saying, "Please stop that." That's a good way of putting it, Melinda.

15:48:06 From EC Matt Duckworth to Everyone:

Not all of the board. Some board members.

15:48:23 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

There are a lot of people on the list to speak, so I'll just echo others and express my SUPPORT for the censure resolution.

15:48:25 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Reacted to "There are a lot of p..." with 👍

15:48:30 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

Reacted to "We're saying, "Pleas..." with 👍

15:48:32 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Removed a 👍 reaction from "There are a lot of p..."

15:48:36 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

Reacted to "There are a lot of p..." with 👍

15:48:41 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Reacted to "There are a lot of p..." with 👍

15:48:41 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

Removed a 👍 reaction from "There are a lot of p..."

15:48:44 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Removed a 👍 reaction from "There are a lot of p..."

15:48:48 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Reacted to "There are a lot of p..." with 👍

15:48:49 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

Reacted to "There are a lot of p..." with 👍

15:48:58 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Reacted to "Not all of the board..." with 👍

15:51:31 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

Board leadership hasn't listened.

15:53:17 From EC Tanichya Wongprasert to Everyone:



I think this resolution serves as our voice to the Board, otherwise the communication is one-way. We have a duty to express our voice.

15:53:42 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

Reacted to "I think this resolut..." with 👍

15:53:52 From EC Tanichya Wongprasert to Everyone:

Reacted to "I think this resolut..." with 👍

15:53:54 From EC Tanichya Wongprasert to Everyone:

Removed a 👍 reaction from "I think this resolut..."

15:54:04 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Reacted to "I think this resolut..." with 👍

15:54:45 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

Reacted to "I think this resolut..." with 👍

15:55:23 From edwardmurray to Everyone:

I know two of the board members personally. I believe both of them would be willing to meet to listen to Academic Senate officers' concerns.

15:55:33 From Malaika Finkelstein to Everyone:

absolutely connected! Thank you, Kate

15:55:53 From edwardmurray to Everyone:

To me that would be a better way to communicate with the Board than sending them a censure letter. At least it should be tried.

15:55:56 From EC Alexis Litzky, she/her to Everyone:

Replying to "I think this resolut..."

Yes, the resolutions are the primary channel for the Academic Senate to speak to the Board, as per Title 5 and our own BP&AP's.

15:56:10 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

Reacted to "I know two of the bo..." with 👍

15:56:24 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

Reacted to "Yes, the resolutions..." with 👍

16:01:23 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

The timeline covers much more than the Cantonese 10+1. That's one thing.

16:01:26 From Abigail Bornstein to Everyone:

Going around participatory governance, 3 resolutions without regard for the budget...

16:02:36 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

That last board meeting was like watching a monthly class of students, except Martinez, who did no homework between meetings.

16:02:46 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

Reacted to "Going around partici..." with 👍

16:03:00 From Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer to Everyone:

Reacted to "That last board meet..." with 👍

16:04:07 From Clare Heimer (she/her) to Everyone:

Reacted to "I think this resolut..." with 👍

16:05:03 From Clare Heimer (she/her) to Everyone:

strongly urge you to remove the whereas clause about the budget if the goal is to address the 10+1! it is not accurate as written and is not directly related to the 10+1

16:05:22 From EC Matt Duckworth to Everyone:

Thank you, Monica!

16:06:25 From Malaika Finkelstein to Everyone:

Reacted to "strongly urge you to..." with 👍

16:06:43 From Mitra Sapienza, she/her, ASCCC North Rep to Everyone:

budget and planning is #10: Processes for institutional planning and budget development

16:06:48 From Wynn Newberry to Everyone:

Reacted to "strongly urge you to..." with 👍

16:06:53 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

Reacted to "budget and planning ..." with 👍

16:07:23 From EC Fanny Law to Everyone:

But what's written regarding the audit report is not accurate.

16:07:42 From Wynn Newberry to Everyone:

Reacted to "But what's written r..." with 👍

16:07:46 From Mitra Sapienza, she/her, ASCCC North Rep to Everyone:

I'm happy to bring this back!

16:08:05 From EC Kimberly Keenan to Everyone:

Reacted to "I'm happy to bring t..." with 👍

16:13:19 From Clare Heimer (she/her) to Everyone:

Replying to "budget and planning ..."

sure, yes! i think the board hasn't really stepped into the academic senate's purview in terms of the right to make recommendations regarding processes for institutional planning and budget development, though, have they? and this whereas clause isn't really about recommendations for processes for institutional planning and budget development, is it? it's about whether the board's budget decisions are good or not. more importantly though i think there are very serious concerns about the accuracy of this paragraph

16:14:50 From Landi Ehnle to Everyone:

Reacted to "strongly urge you to..." with 👍

16:15:44 From Mitra Sapienza, she/her, ASCCC North Rep to Everyone:

Replying to "budget and planning ..."

we'll take a look, for sure. Appreciate the feedback, Claire. I think the concern is primarily with showing the varieties of ways how the Board is veering out of their lane into operations.

16:15:50 From EC Malcolm Hillan to Everyone:

I would urge those who have amendments to offer to work between now and next meeting with the drafter of the resolution (Mitra). If, with their input, she can come up with a Resolution acknowledging those thoughts, yet still close enough to her original intention to bring to the group, we may have something we can vote on without tripping all over each other trying to wordsmith on the floor of the Senate.

16:16:18 From Mitra Sapienza, she/her, ASCCC North Rep to Everyone:

Replying to "budget and planning ..."

sorry! I misspelled your name, Clare!

16:16:36 From Mitra Sapienza, she/her, ASCCC North Rep to Everyone:

Reacted to "I would urge those w..." with ❤️

16:17:08 From Mitra Sapienza, she/her, ASCCC North Rep to Everyone:

Replying to "I would urge those w..."

yes! feel free to send me notes via email any time between now and Friday before next ASEC meeting! msapienz@ccsf.edu

16:18:05 From Craig Kleinman to Everyone:

Reacted to "I would urge those w..." with 👍

16:18:12 From Clare Heimer (she/her) to Everyone:

Replying to "budget and planning ..."

no worries! yeah i think my concern is just that making big-picture budget decisions is precisely the board's lane, and i think overall they're actually doing a pretty good job on it. i'd be happy to follow up more another time but i do have to head out for now! feel free to reach out, cheimer@ccsf.edu.