



# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Bungalow 604, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115

[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) email: [smiragli@ccsf.edu](mailto:smiragli@ccsf.edu)

### CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council FINAL MINUTES

Wednesday, March 20, 2024, 2:30-5:00 pm  
MUB 140 or Via Zoom

[March 20, 2024 Meeting Materials](#) | [ASEC Zoom Meeting Pro Tips](#) | [Community Guidelines](#) | [Guide to CCSF Acronyms](#)

**Council members present:** Adam D'Acquisto, Monica Bosson, Matthew Duckworth, Katia Fuchs, Michael Greenberg, Stephan Johnson, J. Malcolm Hillan, Kimberly Keenan, Fanny Law, Alex Leyton, Alexis Litzky, Ying Liu, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Craig Persiko, Robin Pugh, Louis Schubert, Richard Taha, Fred Teti, Jib Wongprasert

**Council members absent:** Jessica Buchsbaum, Thomas Kennedy, Ron Page, Caroline Priestley, Nuala Sheetz (on leave)

**Other Senators present:** Abigail Bornstein, Mary Bravewoman, Craig Kleinman, Megan Corry, Dayamudra Dennehy, Landi Ehline, Diana Garcia-Denson, Gina Hector, Dana Jae LaBrecque, Anna Lisa Helmy, Andrew King, Lisa King, Lillian Marrujo-Duck, Holly Stevens, Megan Sweeney

**Guests:** Erin Denney, Jennifer Kienzle, Leslie Simon

#### 1. Call to Order 2:30

President Miraglia read the land acknowledgement:

*We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders, and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.*

Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at

- <https://native-land.ca>
- <https://www.ramaytush.org/>
- <https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/>

## 2. Public Comment

- a. Fred Teti: The Education Policies Committee met on Monday of last week. At that meeting, we recommended for Senate consideration the changes in AP 6.30 Credit for Prior Learning, which is on today's consent agenda. We will meet again on the 1st when we will continue discussing Standards of Scholarship. General Instruction, and Auditing. We will also start looking at new policy drafts for Work Experience and for Field Trips and Excursions. Anyone wanting more information is welcome to email me. For those of you knew Ellen Wall...the naming proposal has cleared the PGC Facilities Committee, the PGC, and the Board Facilities Committee. Next Stop: The Board itself. Maybe it'll be official before the end of this academic year!
- b. Monica Bosson: Shared her experience getting a copy of the book *The College Student's Guide to Mental Health* and you can get it delivered to your mailbox.
- c. Madeline Mueller: Made a comment about generational happiness research.

## 3. Reports

### a. Chancellor's Report

The Chancellor provided a video report and updated the Council on a number of items, including increases in spring enrollment, overall growth in the course schedule, heating updates in the Arts buildings, the environmental review for potential parking structures, repaving and painting the MUB parking lot, and the revised Frida Kahlo Quick-Build plan.

### b. Officers Report

President Miraglia provided a report. See Appendix A for the full report.

### c. AFT Report

AFT President Mary Bravewoman provided an update about the current status of AFT elections and what to expect from the AFT Elections commissioners for candidates and voting.

### d. Student Chancellor report - no report at this meeting.

### e. Committee on Committees report

Vice President Law presented a list of appointments on behalf of the Committee on Committees.

## 4. Consent Agenda

- a. Approval of Minutes from March 6, 2024

**Resolution 2024.03.20.4A** Approval of Minutes: Minutes from March 6, 2024

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the minutes for March 6, 2024.

Adopted by consent.

b. Approval of Committee Appointments

**Resolution 2024.03.20.4B** Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the following appointments:

**CTE**

Vivien Mun (DSPS), appointment

Beth Freedman (Health Education), reappointment

Carina Lin (Counseling), reappointment

Robert Del Vecchio (Engineering & Technology), reappointment

**Scholarship**

Melinda Weil (Astronomy), reappointment

Neela Chatterjee (ESL), reappointment

Adriana Garcia (Counseling), reappointment

Steven Brown (Environmental Horticulture/Floristry), reappointment

**TLTR**

Kevin Sherman (Cinema), reappointment

Sheri Miraglia (Biology), reappointment

Shannon Nixon (Biology), reappointment

Dora Rodriguez (DSPS), reappointment

Kristin Smith (English), reappointment

**Works of Art**

Barbara Lass (Behavioral Sciences), reappointment

Michelle Nermon (Architecture), reappointment

**Education Policies**

Elaine Avrus (Counseling), appointment

Bibit Traut (Biology), reappointment

Adopted by consent.

c. [Incorporation of DEIAA Language into Faculty Evaluation Forms](#)

**Resolution 2024.03.20.4C** Approval of Updated Faculty Evaluation Forms with DEIAA Language

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the updated Faculty Evaluation Forms with DEIAA Language.

Adopted by consent.

d. [AP 6.30 Credit for Prior Learning Fall '24 revision](#)

**Resolution 2024.03.20.4D** Approval of AP 6.30 Credit for Prior Learning

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the revised AP 6.30 Credit for Prior Learning.

Adopted by consensus.

5. Unfinished Business

a. Resolution of Censure of the Board of Trustees' Failure to Meet Accreditation Standards

Mitra Sapienza, Equity Coordinator and Past-Academic Senate President, re-introduced the resolution with some specific updates and changes based on Executive Council feedback.

3 amendments were moved and seconded:

1. Motion to strike the timeline footnote. The motion failed.
2. Motion to split the resolution. The motion failed.
3. Motion to strike the first bullet point in the timeline footnote about the audit report. The motion passed.

**Resolution 2024.03.20.5A** Resolution of Censure of the Board of Trustees' Failure to Meet Accreditation Standards

Whereas Title 5 § 53200 states that areas of academic and professional matters (10+1) are the purview of the Academic Senate in areas of "7. Faculty roles and involvement in accreditation processes, including self-study and annual reports"; and

Whereas, CCSF faculty are deeply committed to the accreditation process and meeting accreditation standards, as evidenced by the heavy faculty participation in writing the [2022 CCSF Institutional Self Evaluation](#) and by all

the ways in which faculty meet the standards every time they participate in curriculum, assessment, and student service matters at CCSF; and

Whereas, the [ACCJC report](#) has placed CCSF on Warning status for the Board's failure to meet three standards—Standard III.D.11 (fiscal stability), Standard IV.C.7 (adherence to policy), and Standard IV.C.12 (non-interference with operations)<sup>1</sup> and

Whereas, continued accreditation problems negatively impact our students, potentially affecting their decision to attend college, creating a lack of trust between the institution and those it is chartered with serving; and

Whereas, CCSF's Academic Senate has communicated concerns over the Board's understanding of their roles and responsibilities vis-à-vis accreditation, using resolutions, public comment and Board Reports over the past 12 months<sup>2</sup>; and

Whereas, at the February, 22, 2024, Board of Trustees meeting, accreditation was not listed explicitly as an agenda item, despite another month having gone by since the "Warning" sanction was received, therefore be it

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council censures the CCSF's Board of Trustees' failure to meet accreditation standards pertaining to the Board's governance of the college, and be it further

Resolved, that CCSF's Academic Senate strongly recommends the Board of Trustees follow the advice of CCSF's Accreditation Liaison Officer (ALO) to form a workgroup, composed of board members, supported by our ALO, to develop a plan to address the unmet Accreditation Standards, to provide quarterly progress reports to the college community at Board Meetings, and to prepare a response to the ACCJC as required in the [January 16, 2024 Action Letter](#).

<sup>1</sup> ACCJC Standard III.D.11 (College Requirement 1): In order to meet the Standard, the Commission requires the Governing Board consider the College's long-range fiscal implications when making financial decisions in order to assure financial stability.

ACCJC Standard IV.C.7 (College Requirement 2): In order to meet the Standard, the Commission requires that the Governing Board act in a manner consistent with its policies and bylaws.

ACCJC Standard IV.C.12 (College Requirement 3): In order to meet the Standard, the Commission requires that the Governing Board allow the Chancellor to implement and administer Board policies without Board interference.

<sup>2</sup> Timeline (in reverse)

The ACCJC Core inquiries, received almost a year ago, were meant to let the college and BoT know where there were accreditation standards requiring attention and remedy, and yet despite this clear warning, with time to remediate, the BoT has failed to meet all accreditation standards related to their governance responsibilities.

Faculty leaders spoke at multiple board meetings over the past 12 months, warning the BoT that they were taking action that could harm our accreditation.

- Jan 25, 2024 meeting, BoT members claimed that we failed to meet two of the three standards because the Board and Chancellor disagree - which is not what is stated in the visiting team's report, demonstrating a lack of understanding of the Trustees' roles and responsibilities around accreditation.
- Jan 25, 2024 BoT meeting, Board members spoke at length about appealing the the ACCJC action, instead of what they need to do to address the standards
- Jan 25, 2024 BoT meeting, despite warnings in the visiting teams report that the level of administrative turnover is hurting the stability of the college, the BoT approved a search for a new Chancellor.
- October 26, 2023 – The ASEC President Board report described how activities to align ASEC Committees to the new 2024 Accreditation standards were ongoing.
- September 28, 2023 – The Academic Senate President Board report discussed how faculty responded to the 2013 accreditation sanctions by developing a process to assess SLOs, and ensure that we would meet that standard (and have met that standard) in the future.
- September 14, 2023 -- Joint letter to BoT from Curriculum Committee, Academic Senate, World Languages Department, and Department Chair Council
- August 25, 2023 – The Academic Senate Board report noted that faculty were nervously anticipating the visiting team based on conversations at ASEC plenary.
- July 10, 2023 -- District made a public statement apologizing for failure to offer 16-unit cert, to include footnote in catalog despite the March 12 ASEC resolution recommending against it.  
<https://www.ccsf.edu/news/city-college-san-francisco-cantonese-certificate>
- June 22, 2023 – BoT ASEC President Report, where Senate leadership reminded the BoT that we were preparing for the visiting team and how our success depended on our ability to address the concerns the ACCJC described in their core inquiries.
- June 22, 2023 BoT -- Academic Senate leadership make public comment regarding 10+1 purview over curriculum usurped by the BoT in regard to notation of Cantonese certificate in the Catalog.
- June 22, 2023 BoT Approve Notation of Cantonese Credit Certificate in 2023-2024 Catalog.
- June 21, 2023 -- News about the Cantonese cert delays citing President Wong who misrepresented actions taken by the Curriculum Committee, violating 10+1 and Board Policy 6.03

- May 18, 2023 -- Academic Senate leadership made public comment to the BoT with concern that "directing" the Chancellor to recall laid-off faculty would be out of compliance with meeting ACCJC standards because it fails to delegate college operations to the Chancellor.
- May 18, 2023 -- Faculty members and department chairs made public comment to express concern with violating accreditation standards around college operations and budget by directing the Chancellor to rescind layoffs
- March 12, 2023 -- ASEC passes Resolution 2023.04.12.7A Observe 10+1 and AB1725 In Regard to the Progress Toward Development of the Cantonese Certificate
- March 23, 2023 – Faculty members and department chairs (2h:35m mark) make public comment re: Cantonese certificate concerns
- January 13, 2023 -- BoT passes resolution, with no consideration of resources, financial or otherwise, (that acknowledges 10+1 in words not subsequent actions) "Supporting the Establishment of Higher Education Cantonese Programs and Articulation Agreements"
- November 13, 2022 -- Wong tells the press that certificates will be offered in fall '23
- February 22, 2022 -- Curriculum Committee discuss with Chancellor violations of 10+1 and BoT

Moved: Richard Taha, Second: Lou Schubert  
Motion passes, 14-5.

b. Resolution Renaming of School

Dean Erin Denney shared the process of gathering feedback and the adoption of a new school name.

**Resolution 2024.03.20.5B** Resolution Changing the Name of the School of Communication Studies, English, and World Languages, and the School of Fine, Applied, and Communication Arts to the School of Arts, Communication, and Languages

Whereas, the majority of the departments in the current Schools of Communication Studies, English, and World Language and Fine, Applied, and Communication Arts were once housed under the same school, the School of Liberal Arts; and

Whereas, these two schools more recently have been centered under the same dean; and

Whereas, a semester-long process involving the dean, chairs, faculty, and staff in the two schools was undertaken to discuss renaming the area with a single unifying name and to determine the name that would best represent all involved; and

Whereas, the departments in the two schools all approved the name chosen, the School of Arts, Communication, and Languages; therefore, let it be

Resolved, that the Academic Senate for City College of San Francisco endorses the change of name from the School(s) of Communication Studies, English, and World Language and Fine, Applied, and Communication Arts to the School of Arts, Communication, and Languages.

Adopted by consensus.

c. The Council took a 5 minute break.

d. Constitution and Bylaws

Councilmember Alexis Litzky led a discussion about possible updates to the Academic Senate Constitution Article 3 about membership and representation limits on the Executive Council. No motion was made to advance a specific option. This item will return at a future meeting for more discussion.

## 6. New Business

a. DSPS Modification of Attendance Requirements Form - this item was postponed to a later meeting.

b. Simple Syllabus Public Facing Page

Associate Dean Jennifer Kienzle and President Miraglia shared their student presentation about Simple Syllabus and demonstrated a potential public facing site for all syllabuses. The Council asked a few questions and President Miraglia said they would agendize this item again after getting more information from the students.

## 7. Adjournment at 5:00pm





## AS President's Report - March 20, 2024

- Faculty Coordinator positions
  - DE, and TLC Coordinators
  - OER Coordinator
  - Equity PD Coordinator
- Spring 2024 ASEC Work
  - Generative AI - Set of Recommendations, Equity, Pedagogy, Policy
    - TLTR Conversations (3/11), ASEC Webpage in development.
  - EFF (back on ASEC agenda on 4/3)
  - Committee Structure (back on ASEC agenda on 4/3)
  - AS Constitution/Bylaws (on today's agenda)